

Regular Meeting — December 1, 2023 9:00am to 11:00am Hyflex Meeting – Room OCT200 and via ZOOM in accordance with AB2449 1 Barnard Drive, Oceanside, CA 92056

OFFICIAL MINUTES

I. Call to Order AS President, Leila Safaralian, respectfully asked for a moment of silence for all innocent lives lost in Israel and Palestine and other regions of the world. She continued with the traditional land acknowledgement that MiraCosta College and its surrounding areas is still home to the six federally recognized bands of the La Jolla, Pala, Pauma, Pechanga, Rincon, Soboba Luiseño/Payómkawichum people. It is also important to acknowledge that this land remains the shared space among Kumeyaay and Ipai peoples. In addition, we pay respect to elders both present and past, the respected keepers of history, culture, wisdom and knowledge.

The meeting was called to order at 9:01am

II. Remote Member Attendance

Description: Academic Senate will consider remote participation of members under the provisions of AB2449, if any. No members requested remote participation under the Just Cause provision of AB2449.

III. Roll Call

Members present: Angela Beltran-Aguilar, Robin Allyn, Sunny Cooke (ex-officio), Erica Duran, Shawn Firouzian, Julie Graboi, Jim Julius, Don Love, curry mitchell, Candy Owens, Brian Page, Hossein Ravanbaksh, Leila Safaralian (President), Alexis Tucker-Sade, Krista Warren

Members absent: Nate Scharf

Remote participation – no vote: Rachel Hastings

Others present: Lance Dumais, Tim Flood, Jeff Ihara, Taya Lazootin, Zhenya Lindstrom, Leslie Marovich, Lisa Niemann, Oswaldo Ramirez, Christina Sharp, Amy Walker-Pinneo, Rhonda Welch-Scalco

IV. Persons Wishing to Address the Senate

Alexis Tucker-Sade wanted to acknowledge that we lost two important women in the past week, Rosalyn Carter and today, Sandra Day O'Connor, the first female Justice on the Supreme Court. She further noted she has been thinking about things that have either long been happening at MiraCosta or, more broadly, happening within our California State school system. She was reading a comment from the Chancellor's Office about the grants for textbooks and looking at AB1111. She was thinking about the ways in which there seems to be a misunderstanding about what Academia is. We are not individually our discipline. Academia is a community, a conversation of voices and it is not up to any of us individually, or any of our colleagues, to decide individually what is or is not our discipline. So, when we say things like discipline experts, what we mean is that we are involved in this ongoing conversation to know our discipline. When we think about professional development, it is something we do every day and becomes really important when we think about how we can judge each other. She hopes we can possibly consider reforming the discourse around judging how one can and cannot teach in the review process. Because we don't have the publish or perish environment, the notions about peer review are sort of lost but you don't get to be the sole arbiter of things. She believes that not being held to account within our disciplines or not focusing enough on our disciplines, leads to what could be a sort of toxic environment around who knows what, who has the right to know what, and who has the right to judge what other people know. We all have to hold ourselves accountable to keep being those experts. If you say you don't want to adopt a ZTC or OER textbook because you save your students money by using an edition from 1995, that is not recognizing that regardless of what your discipline is, it is changing and we owe it to our students to give them the most up to date, highest quality material at the most affordable, accessible prices, hopefully, zero.

Julie Graboi noted that on Wednesday she had a productive meeting with Safaralian and mitchell. She noted we are going to be talking about some of the policies that we have voted on later when Tim Flood visits. The recommendation that was given to her was that they can change the minutes without letting us know but it is our responsibility to go to the portal and to read those updated minutes. She asked how many of the experienced Senators are acquainted with the portal or understood that this was our responsibility to check, to make sure that the minutes had not been updated from the agenda that is sent out. An outcome of the meeting she has been thinking about is that we should receive an alert if the minutes are changed. Graboi noted she has a vision disability and always wants to prepare for the meeting, but she does not feel comfortable voting on

minutes she hasn't been able to read. It would seem to be very easy for there to be a flag if the minutes are updated so that we, at least have a chance to read them especially when the substance and the history of a meeting have been changed. The second thing that she proposed is perhaps to agendize at a future meeting, training on the portal. Safaralian showed her how to access different records but when she accessed it from home, she found recordings from 2016. She recommends that as part of our training, we all need to have access to the portal even more so, so we can involve our constituents and find the source documents.

V. Changes to Agenda Order – None.

VI. Consent Calendar

A. Approve Minutes of the Regular Meeting of November 17, 2023

B. Equivalencies

Description: Approve two equivalencies; one for English and one for Mathematics Basic Skills: Noncredit.

The equivalency for English was removed from the consent calendar and will come back at a later date. The equivalency for Mathematics Basic Skills: Noncredit was removed from the consent calendar for discussion.

The consent calendar was approved by unanimous vote.

MSF (mitchell / Warren) [Duran, Tucker-Sade, and Graboi voted yes, Beltran abstained] to approve the equivalency for Mathematics Basic Skills: Noncredit.

Discussion ensued concerning the equivalency for Mathematics Basic Skills: Noncredit. It was asked how the committee determined that the physics class and second computer science class related to the discipline of mathematics. It was also noted that the applicant's cover letter was for a physics instructor and not math. HR did a detailed review and felt he met enough units to teach mathematics. They also consulted with Beth Powell, discipline expert, who vetted his classes for adequate content and agreed he met the equivalency. It then went through the equivalency committee. Ihara noted that the committee was not completely unconcerned but felt with Powell's recommendation, they could forward it to Academic Senate as acceptable.

Warren asked what the difference is between noncredit and credit faculty, further noting that there is an upcoming fulltime hire for noncredit math. This applicant would be able to apply for that position. She asked if we are bending our standards, and further offered that teaching a noncredit student is complex. With all the concerns and questions, Ihara suggested sending it back to the equivalency committee for more clarification. This would be the equivalent of teaching 9th through 12th grade high school math and a bachelor's degree in physics would give him the equivalency to teach algebra which is the highest level of math taught in noncredit.

It was determined that this equivalency will be sent back to the Equivalency Committee for more clarification and will come back at the next meeting Academic Senate meeting on December 15th.

VII. Reports

A. Academic Senate President – Safaralian

Academic Senate President, Leila Safaralian, thanked mitchell, Adler, and all senators and guest speakers who took part in the November 17th meeting. Mitchell did an amazing job.

Jim Julius, Krista Warren, Maria Figueroa and she attended the ASCCC Fall plenary from November 16-18. There were many different sessions during the first two days on different topics. The recording of these sessions can be found on the <u>ASCCC website</u>. There were also some general sessions including:

- DEIA in faculty evaluation. A FACCC member had a session about this and basically talked about lack of guidance from the Chancellor's Office.
- FACCC: the DEIA evaluation is for all employees in the state of California Community Colleges, not for faculty only.
- The Chancellor's Office shall adopt and publish guidance describing DEIA implementation. That has not happened yet.
- There has to be professional development related to DEIA, how to improve it, how to not see this as punitive but as a way to improve our teaching and learning for everyone.
- Just a flex workshop is not enough, we need a series of workshops and professional development for the campus community.

- o Administration should devote budget to this DEIA professional development and implementation.
- Contract is above policy so the AS and FA/AF Unions should work together to create the process for faculty after receiving the guidelines from the Chancellor's Office. Mary Gross for the FA and Krista Warren for the AF Union are both ready to collaborate on this task.

It was suggested that the ASCCC and FACCC offer a webinar to bring more clarity to this issue. They are also waiting on some litigation that is in process related to this issue. This will delay the process. Warren, Gross and Safaralian talked a bit about this and we are all studying this issue very closely and will provide updates as they are received.

Exploring the transfer journey for African-American students. This was disseminating information about a study involving 7000 African-American students and will share the PowerPoint faculty. The highlights that were the most important success factors for African-American students who successfully transfer to a four-year university are:

- Passing transfer level Math and English
- Academic Counseling
- Being part of Umoja

Chancellor, Sonya Christian, had a session and talked about the dual enrollment Vision 2030 that was discussed during the AS meeting on November 3rd. AB288 brought colleges to the high schools with dual enrollment. Every 9th grader should be enrolled in dual enrollment and she was challenged but some faculty who spoke about lack of resources to expand the dual enrollment to that level. She also received some questions from faculty about lack of attention to non-credit in her plans.

Thank you for the great conversation and honest feedback about Guided Pathways. mitchell and Safaralian follow up with the college leadership after each conversation. One thing that was suggested during the Guided Pathways conversation was to arrange for a scheduling summit. Mark your calendars for the Scheduling Summits that are scheduled for February 29th and March 29th (fifth Friday) and let constituents know about these dates. More information will be coming.

Safaralian met with Mikala Hutchinson this week along with Omar Jimenez and JD Banks regarding our team for January 19th. Hutchinson had a great idea that she will share.

Mark your calendars for a CPC Information Session; Local Degree Updates from Title 5 Changes on December 6th, from 3-4pm Hyflex. See the email from Scott Fallstrom.

The end of the year celebration will take place, next Friday, December 8th at the El Camino Country Club, 3202 Vista Way, Oceanside.

There will be another Senate meeting on December 15th since there are more equivalencies coming to approve. Breakfast will be provided on December 15th.

After watching the entire recording of the November 17th meeting, she thanked everyone for all the thoughtful discussions. There was a comment about the minutes of one of our meetings and asking if we were in compliance with the Brown Act. She is happy to let you know that she ran this by a couple of people including the ASCCC Vice President, Manuel Valez, and they were all reassuring that it is fine to make changes to minutes after the agenda is sent, or to any document attached to the agenda, and show the changes during the meeting.

The Academic Senate and Classified Senate are making plans for the Second Annual Cultivating Human Connection event that will be held on Thursday, January 18th from 9:00-11:00am in the Dining Hall, including breakfast. The theme is Season of Change: Struggling, navigating, and thriving with change. All MiraCostans are welcome to attend.

There is no Guided Pathways report but they want to highlight the Scheduling Summit.

B. College Superintendent/President – Cooke

Superintendent/President Sunny Cooke noted that administrative hiring to identify permanent administrators for positions currently being filled by interims is moving forward. The goal is to complete as many permanent hires (no new positions) as soon as is feasible so that we can allow for workload impacts as a result of faculty hiring season which is traditionally in spring. The positions that will need to be permanently determined currently held by interims in these roles include Chief IDEA Officer, Interim Dean of A&R, and Instructional Dean (SEC). The Permanent Dean of Counseling will be determined after completion of the Chief IDEA officer is complete. Classified professional replacement hiring is a year-round process and regular reports are made to the Classified Senate about progress on this. With regard

to faculty hiring, we are looking forward to hiring 11 faculty colleagues for fall 2024. These are: Categorically funded full-time faculty requests (non-district funding).

- 1. Student Accessibility Services (SAS)
- 2. EOPS Foster Youth Counselor
- 3. EOPS CalWORKs Counselor-(filled effective January 1, 2024)

District-funded full-time faculty requests include:

- 1. Psychology
- 2. Ethnic Studies
- 3. Physics
- 4. Nursing and Allied Health Medical Surgical Expertise for Part-Time LVN Programming
- 5. Adult High School
- 6. Veterans Counselor
- 7. Nursing and Allied Health Medical Surgical Expertise for RN Programming
- 8. Psychology

Dr. Cooked shared the news we are hearing at this point of the state's COLA. We are hearing numbers for 2024-25 like 0.6% or 1% COLA. This is in contrast to the 8.22% given for this year from the state. Recall, that in order to pay for this historically high COLA, the state had to borrow one-time funds from the CA Community Colleges from the previous year. You can see the very volatile ups and downs of these economic numbers reflecting uncertainty in our system and our broader economy. Even though MiraCosta is generally not benefitted by the COLA numbers as we are not apportionment based, it is still an important economic indicator that we watch.

The All District Webinar was held yesterday and along with announcements, the focus was on the recent challenges in infrastructure, power outages, and the construction vehicle accident resulting in demolition of the pedestrian bridge at the Oceanside Campus. The other focus was on voluntary retirement savings options for employees. The recording will be shared in the MiraCostan on Monday so please look for more information about that.

Plans are underway for the January 19th All College Day. While the format will be different this time, we will still have social time over breakfast starting at 8am, followed by a District Webinar style sharing of important information. We will then offer two different time slots for a variety of breakout sessions. Lunch will offer another opportunity for time together and then we will offer optional tours of the new buildings on the Oceanside Campus between 1-4pm. Please save the date and mark your calendars. We will be offering Hyflex options for breakouts sessions and streaming options if people cannot make it to campus that day. However, we encourage folks to participate in person.

We have about 60 MiraCostans participating in the Encinitas Holiday Parade this Saturday December 2nd. Thanks to our PIO office and Stever Torok and MOJO for their participation and leadership.

Happy Holidays to all! While the last of the semester is incredibly stressful for students and employees alike, hoping you will enjoy time with loved ones over the holidays. Please take care of yourselves and get some rest and rejuvenation!

B. Classified Senate - Phillips

Classified Senate Vice President, Ingrid Phillips not in attendance. Leila Safaralian reported on the Holiday Party on her behalf earlier in her report.

C. Associated Student Government – Hutchinson

ASG representative, Mikala Hutchinson was not in attendance. No report.

VIII. New Business

A. Academic Senate Faculty Awards – ASCCC Hayward Award – Julius

Description: The Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC) has called for nominations for the 2023-24 <u>Hayward Award</u>, which "honors community college full-time and part-time faculty who demonstrate the highest level of commitment to their students, college, and profession." With submission deadline of Sunday December 10, AS is being asked to suspend the rules on this first read and approve the Awards Committee recommendations of the nominations of Katrina Tamura (Associate Faculty) and Eric Bishop (Full-Time Faculty) for the Hayward Award.

MSP (Allyn / Warren) [Candy Owens was not present for the vote] to suspend the rules in order to vote on the Academic Senate Faculty Awards – ASCCC Hayward Award nominations.

MSP (Ravanbaksh / Allyn) [Candy Owens was not present for the vote] to approve the nominations of Katrina Tamura (Associate Faculty) and Eric Bishop (Full-Time Faculty) for the ASCCC Hayward Award.

IX. Information / Discussion

A. BP 6250 and BP 6300 Clarifications – Tim Flood

Description: Clarification of changes to BP 6250 and information regarding prior approval of BP 6300 in relationship to the district reserve policy and the Board's past approval.

Safaralian explained that after long discussions, Senate voted on BP/AP 6250. Further noted that she met with Graboi and provided more information and answered her questions to the best of their knowledge. A few senators have expressed that they are tired of hearing about this and so she indicated that this will be the last time we have this conversation and clarification.

Flood explained that he created this presentation after getting questions from Senate. He started to explain that the BP/AP goes through either the operational areas and/or the constituent groups. This one went through BPC, then to AS, then went to College Council. If it is an AP, it is done and becomes official. If it is a BP, it then goes to the Board for a first and second read. One of the guestions that came up was if the Board was aware of these changes in policy because it was their first read. Flood put this together and brought it back to BPC to take a look at this so that if they had questions from their constituent groups, they would be able to answer them and respond with facts and information. There were two areas that were in question within this AP. Once was the reserve amounts that talks about the Chancellor's recommendation of a 5% expenditure. We also talked about the Chancellor's office has since changed that to two months' worth of expenditures and then also about the resolution that would go to the superintendent of schools. We said that the Board was aware of these changes before. Back in October, the Board passed unanimously by a vote of 7:0, BP 6300 which specifically talks about two months' worth of unrestricted general fund operations, 17%. The Board's role in this is to make sure that we are fiscally prudent and to provide long-term stability for the Budget and the college. So, this went through BPC, college council, and was unanimously approved by the Board, as was AP 6305, our administrative procedure that specifically addresses reserves. That was also approved by BPC in September and then by College Council in October. This is not something we are doing in a vacuum. It was a recommendation by CCLC to put it into 6250. Every other SDICCCA college reflects. It is either 16% or 16.67% if they do the exact math for two months' worth of expenditures. It was also part of our emergency conditions allowance and why you saw this go to the Board initially. This allowed us to protect our finances and funding during Covid and the drastic declines we saw in FTS during that time. The Board reviewed that emergency condition allowance declaration they approved at August 18th and the Chancellor's Office approved it on the 22nd. It says to have a recovery plan and also to have a policy aiming to align reserve balances based off of Government Finance Officers Association (GFOA) recommendations. This is the Chancellor's Office utilizing best practices from government finance officers to align instead of grabbing something that may not pertain but instead, using best practices. It was also part of the Chancellor's Office recommendation. We received a memo regarding architecture and wanting us to increase those reserves by up to two months' worth of expenditures. Flood noted that he sits on the actual Board, and they are in the process of updating their budget and accounting manual, known as BAM. It outlines all the requirements as far as what community colleges need to do, how we categorize our finds, and more. He provided a component of the draft 2023 budget and accounting manual that specifically talks about making sure that we align with GFOA and have a general fund balance of no less than two months. The next were guestions about doing resolution to the superintendent of schools. It talks about protections and that the Board has to be informed when we are moving money between major classifications. We provide reports to let the Board know of major moves and the Board has to approve this before the money is moved. There was a form that we used to have to fill out with the County Office of Education. It was a normal standard process of year end closing. An email from both the County Office of Education and our independent auditor says that this no longer applies to us. The County Office of Education does not have access to our ledgers anymore since we have become fiscally independent. They used to need that document to prove that the Board had approved it for audit purposes. We now take care of that ourselves since we have become fiscally independent. The only thing they have access to is any interest from any money that we have in the county fund. The auditor recommends that if is good practice that if something doesn't apply to you, remove it from the policy. MCC was the last college in SDICCCA to go fiscally independent. Flood wanted to assure the Senate that the Board had approved this and a policy that we are being fiscally prudent. They had seen it well in advance. The Board is well aware of what they read and sign. They ask

great questions.

When asked why Flood and not Maria Figueroa, who is the faculty co-chair of BPC, presented and not her, it was explained by Dr. Cooke that there are AS subcommittees and governance committees. BPC is not an AS committee and so whoever is available to present will come to do so on the committee's behalf. Graboi noted that Flood said that moving accounts around from administrative procedure was a form process. When it was before us, we made some changes to some of the policy or we made suggestions to some of the issues. She shared some of these documents with her constituents and shared some examples of what they said. They mentioned that everything should be written in the active voice because there were comments about how confused people were. Clear communication really resides with the writer, the author. She gave an example of something that was actually changed during this meeting that Flood has identified as a form process. Number 2 says, the term major classification shall refer to the major object code classification from the California Community College budget and accounting manual (1,000, 2,000, 3,000). Wouldn't it have been clearer to say 1,000 is faculty pay, 2,000 is faculty benefits, 3,000 is staff benefits and pay? So, these are the accounts besides office supplies that can be moved around. She indicated there is an idea that if you are going to use a substitution like a pronoun, you need to first identify the subject. Wouldn't it have been clearer to identify the faculty pay, etc. She communicated with Flood because to her it ventured into the area of working conditions which, within the context of the Faculty Senate, we are not supposed to talk about. She let him know she would not vote on something or approve something that could come back and harm her constituents and colleagues at MCC because if you can move these things around, she will not support it. Flood wrote back a very terse email saying she was getting into the area of working conditions and that we voted and passed working conditions based on this policy that they wrote this way. He said she was the one who brought this up. Dr. Cooke offered that while the AS has a role in budget processes, the Board has the fiduciary responsibility for any expenditures that are made in contracts and encumbrances that we make. We do report all those shifts between categories. An example was given of reporting to the Board any moves that are made such as cutting sections. We plan for "X" number of sections, enrollment declined, and we had to cut sections. The budget says we are going to spend "X" millions of dollars on faculty salaries because it ties to the cost of each section. When you cut a section, you don't have a faculty member to pay and so we report that to the Board as savings from that category. We don't report that to the AS on a quarterly basis because it's not the AS role as a fiduciary manager. The role of AS is in budget processes and that role is done by BPC through the AS's appointment of multiple faculty members and a co-chair to BPC. She suggested Graboi refer to the Board documents that are very transparent and regularly reported. Flood also noted that among the categories of 1,000, 2,000, 3,000, 4,000, 5,000, and 6,000, we didn't touch any of that language. The transfers between expenditure classifications must be approved by a majority vote of the members of the Board or approval of transfers between expenditure, classifications, and other major object codes may be on a ratification basis. The only thing we removed was the form in which it says that we would send a resolution to the assistant to the superintendent of schools because that doesn't apply to us. We did not touch any other documents. A sentence was removed that no longer applies. Safaralian also explained that she shared with Graboi the red-lined document and that number 2 was not changed. She also noted that Graboi gave a handout at the first meeting indicating the categories. Graboi noted that she thinks these policies should be written in the clearest way. To Dr. Cooke's point, we should go to the Board meetings. She asked how many have tuned into a Board meeting. They are audio, the reception is bad. Most other public meetings have video and it should be memorialized. Based on her experience of presenting in front of different Boards, MCC has perhaps the least transparent Board of Trustees. They are still using the emergency position to have only audio and not to have video. Ours is on video and we could do a lot more to memorialize those meetings so we can go back. Documents were also mentioned. Apparently, they are on the portal as established earlier. She didn't know about the portal and we don't know our responsibilities. Safaralian clarified that we didn't establish anything, that Graboi only made a public comment. Graboi further noted that if it is our responsibility to go back and look at all these things, she would like to have the easiest access possible. Dr. Cooke noted that all Brown Act groups, including AS and the Board of Trustees, have to be only a couple of clicks away. The are actually on our website including all the agendas, minutes, upcoming, and historical documents. When Graboi noted that videos are different, Dr. Cooke noted she was not commenting on videos but on documents. She further suggested that if Graboi has comments about the Board meetings, she might want to take them to the Board.

Warren suggested to take all of this as a learning curve and ask questions, but we don't need to stop ourselves in the work that we need to do because we don't fully understand the full scope. Talk to the people from where it comes from, those who work on this in our governance.

Tucker-Sade further offered that this seemed to become a challenge because on the one hand it seemed as though we are increasing the amount of savings while at the same time, we talked about how money can be moved around. She noted it was 5% then became 17% and so how do we make up that extra 12%. Where does that money come from? Flood appreciates all the comments and wanted to add that the District has maintained between 24% and 25% in the balance reserve for a number of years. The 17% is not saying we are increasing but rather where we want our threshold to be.

Safaralian noted that while BPC is not a Brown Act committee, they conduct their meetings in person and on Zoom and all are welcome to attend and learn about the budget. We should also trust our system and faculty representation we have in place. Academic Senate is made up of elected faculty to represent all faculty in 10+1 matters and we are not going to agree with each other all the time, but should appreciate these disagreements.

B. Exploring Dual Enrollment Faculty Perspectives – Lance Dumais, Shawn Firouzian, Taya Lazootin, Zhenya Lindstrom, Leslie Marovich, Lisa Niemann, Oswaldo Ramirez, Christina Sharp, Amy Walker-Pinneo. Rhonda Welch-Scalco

Description: The Academic Senate is having thematic months throughout the year. For the month of December, we are focusing on Dual Enrollment. MiraCosta Dual Enrollment faculty will address their motivations for joining, years of teaching experience, and sharing highlights and obstacles encountered in dual enrollment.

Safaralian thanked Shawn Firouzian the leader of dual enrollment in the Math Department and an advocate and part of the dual enrollment advisory.

Firouzian introduced the visiting members who teach dual enrollment and asked them to introduce themselves, explain what led them to joining dual enrollment, how many years of teaching experience they have, and share some highlights and some challenges they have encountered in dual enrollment. Visit this LINK to hear the full Dual Enrollment discussion from this meeting.

The Dual Enrollment faculty will return at the meeting of December 15th to continue the discussion with the Senate body.

X. Senator Reports

Warren encourages everyone to join the Faculty Associate of California Community Colleges <u>FACCC</u>. A lot of faculty are doing this work at the Sacramento level in relation to teaching and learning, working conditions, and legislation. If you don't have time to be involved, at least become a member of FACCC. Safaralian shared the MESA flyer that Angela Beltran-Aguilar share with her. Beltran-Aguilar noted that all the information you need is now on their newly published <u>MESA website</u>. They are starting to receive interest forms from students and they hopes to continue this through the beginning of the spring semester. Questions can be directed to Angela Beltran-Aguilar or Jessican Perez Corona.

Cooke announced the holiday concert taking place on December 6th in the Concert Hall with conductor, Branden Muresan.

mitchell referred everyone to the <u>website</u> for the Calendar Review taskforce and to check out the town hall meeting that was conducted yesterday.

XI. Adjournment – The meeting adjourned at 11:39am.